

From: [McChesney, Gerry](#)
To: [Gary Witmer](#)
Subject: Peer reviews on your salamander report
Date: Tuesday, March 27, 2018 5:09:58 PM
Attachments: [Review of Draft Final Report QA-2688.docx](#)
[An assessment of the potential hazards of anticoagulant rodenticides to salamander BAR 302118.docx](#)
[Howald Review for FINWR March 2018.docx](#)
[Howald additional comments.docx](#)
Importance: High

Hi Gary,

I have three reviews of your report from: Barnett Rattner, Gregg Howald, and Bethany Kunz (USGS). Those reviews are attached.

Also, Vance Vredenburg just responded to my request for a review late last week, so I sent him a copy. He said he could review within a few days. Getting Vance's comments would be beneficial especially regarding capture methodology, housing, input on Results based on his salamander expertise, and having him check acknowledgements for his part of the study. I'll send that as soon as I have it.

Barnett commented separately that you are welcome to contact him if you have any questions about is comments.

The reviews provide some excellent suggestions for improving the report. You'll see there is some overlap in suggested changes. Here are a few that I would especially like to see addressed:

- Dr. Rattner provided some good suggestions on improving the summary and analyses of salamander weight change;
- Addressing the cricket mortality issue. This may need a separate section to summarize.
- "Hazard" vs "risk": clarify based on Dr. Rattner's comments.
- In the Methods, describe how much rodenticide was placed in cages and how much was sprinkled on crickets.
- I also noticed that cricket consumption per salamander is not in the Appendix. Given the attention to cricket consumption, that would be beneficial to have.
- A short Conclusions section would also be beneficial, including information on what the study told us and what it didn't tell us.

When you send the revised report, please include a summary of how you addressed comments.

Please let me know if you would like to discuss the reviews. Thank you for your efforts and I look forward to the revised report.

Gerry

Gerry McChesney
Manager, Farallon Islands National Wildlife Refuge and
Common Murre Restoration Project
U.S. Fish and Wildlife Service
San Francisco Bay National Wildlife Refuge Complex
1 Marshlands Road

Fremont, CA 94555

Phone: 510-792-0222, ext. 222, cell: 510-435-9151

Email: Gerry_McChesney@fws.gov

https://www.fws.gov/refuge/farallon_islands/

<http://www.fws.gov/sfbayrefuges/murre/murrehome.htm>

[Follow us on Facebook!](#)
